



LEESBURG BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW

ADDENDUM #4 TO STAFF REPORT*

SPECIAL MEETING: MONDAY, APRIL 13, 2015

AGENDA ITEM #5

*****PUBLIC HEARING REMAINS OPEN ON ALL FOUR APPLICATIONS*****

BAR Case Numbers: TLHP-2014-0115 (Certificate of Appropriateness)
TLHP-2014-0116 (Certificate of Appropriateness)
TLHP-2014-0117 (Certificate of Appropriateness)
TLHP-2014-0118 (Certificate of Appropriateness)

Addresses: 112 Edwards Ferry Road NE
110 Edwards Ferry Road NE
108 Edwards Ferry Road NE
106 Edwards Ferry Road NE

Proposed Action: Demolish contributing historic buildings for courthouse expansion

PIN (Parcel ID#): 231-38-8886

Zoning/Overlay: GC/H-1 Overlay District

Applicant: Marlene Walli Shade, AIA, Dewberry Architects Inc.

Owner: Loudoun County
c/o Peter Hargreaves, DTCl, Design Manager

Reviewer: Tom Scofield, AICP, Preservation Planner

Recommendation: Continue review of application to mutually agreed upon meeting date

Critical Action Date: May 18, 2015 (extension mutually agreed upon by BAR and applicant/owner)

Proposal

The following request is proposed in these Certificate of Appropriateness applications:

- Demolish the contributing historic resources at 112 Edwards Ferry Road NE, 110 Edwards Ferry Road NE, 108 Edwards Ferry Road NE, and 106 Edwards Ferry Road NE, primary resources in the Leesburg National Register Historic District and locally designated Old & Historic District, to construct the New District Courthouse.

Summary of New Information

- H-1 overlay design review matrix for post-demolition plans (New District Courthouse building) prepared by Town staff using Old & Historic District Design Guidelines; document attached.
- Report on keeping oldest portions of 110 and 112 Edwards Ferry Road NE prepared by Dewberry, Inc. (Loudoun County Board of Supervisors agenda item for April 15, 2015); document attached or available Monday morning.
- Report on removal of noncontributing and "less-historic" rear additions on 106 and 108 Edwards Ferry Road NE; presentation by Town staff at April 13th BAR meeting.
- Request for Interest & Addendum #1 issued by Loudoun County for relocating any or all of the four Edwards Ferry Road houses; document attached (9 pages excluding intensive-level survey forms).

*This addendum applies to previous staff reports prepared for the four Certificate of Appropriateness demolition applications at the addresses indicated above. Please refer to the original staff reports for specific details on each building.

H-1 OVERLAY, OLD & HISTORIC DISTRICT							
DESIGN REVIEW MATRIX							
Project name: <u>New District Courthouse (Review of post-demolition plans)</u>							
Old & Historic District Design Guidelines				<u>Guideline Achieved</u>			
Chapter VII. Guidelines for New Construction							
#	<u>Guideline Summary</u>	<u>Project Applicability</u>	<u>No houses saved</u>	<u>1 ½ houses saved*</u>	<u>2 houses saved</u>	<u>4 houses saved</u>	<u>Comments</u>
A. Choosing the Appropriate Building Form for the Site							
1.	Traditionally Commercial Forms	Not applicable					
2.	Traditionally Residential Forms	Not applicable					
3.	Institutional Forms						
	• Respect and relate to surrounding historic context--Courthouse block.	Applicable	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
	• Respect and relate to surrounding historic context--Edwards Ferry Road.	Applicable	No	Somewhat	Greater extent	Substantial	
4.	Larger Individual Lots and Multi-lot Sites--employ techniques to reduce visual presence with respect to historic buildings in the immediate context.	Applicable	No	Somewhat	Greater extent	Substantial	
	Standards for determining most appropriate building design for site (p. 85)						
	• Level of historic integrity of surrounding neighborhood	Applicable	No, destroys integrity	Weakens integrity	Weakens integrity	Yes, enhances integrity	
	• Overall dominant physical character of surrounding neighborhood	Applicable	No, changes character	No, changes character	Weakens character	Yes, maintains character	
	• Overall design character of surrounding area--"avoid taking design cues from non-historic structures"	Applicable	Design cues from existing crthse block	Design cues from existing crthse block	Design cues from crthse block & area	Design cues from crthse block & area	
6.	Multiple-tenant commercial properties should be designed so that all doors, windows, building materials, textures, colors and storefront features are compatible.	Not applicable					
B. Additions to Existing Buildings							
Not applicable							
C. Setback							
1.	Construct new buildings in order to reinforce the traditional plane of building walls along the street.	Applicable	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
2.	Relate the setback and spacing of any new construction to the character of the surrounding historic buildings in the neighborhood. Keep setbacks consistent with the setbacks of a majority of historic buildings on the block and across the street.	Applicable	No	Somewhat	Yes	Yes	
3.	For new governmental or institutional buildings, either reinforce the building plane through a minimal setback, or use a deep setback within a landscaped area to emphasize the civic function of the structure.	Applicable	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
4.	For transitional sites located between two distinctive areas of setback, such as between contributing and noncontributing buildings, the setback should defer to that of the contributing buildings.	Applicable	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
D. Orientation							
1.	For buildings on interior lots, orient the facades of new buildings to the street onto which the lot faces.	Not applicable					

DESIGN REVIEW MATRIX							
Project name: <u>New District Courthouse (Review of post-demolition plans)</u>							
Old & Historic District Design Guidelines Chapter VII. Guidelines for New Construction				<u>Guideline Achieved</u>			
#	<u>Guideline Summary</u>	<u>Project Applicability</u>	<u>No houses saved</u>	<u>1 ½ houses saved*</u>	<u>2 houses saved</u>	<u>4 houses saved</u>	<u>Comments</u>
2.	If, due to site constraints, it is determined that new construction must be oriented so that the primary facade does not face the street, then the secondary elevation facing the street must be designed with form, composition, and details consistent with and appropriate to the primary facade.	Applicable	Yes	Yes	???	???	
3.	If a new building is to be constructed on a corner lot, the building should be designed so that architectural emphasis is placed on two elevations; either hierarchically, with emphasis on the facade oriented toward the major street; or equally, with both elevations treated as primary facades.	Applicable	Yes	Yes	???	???	
<i>E. Spacing</i>							
1.	The relationship of a building to the open spaces between it and adjoining buildings should be visually compatible with the spacing of adjacent buildings.	Applicable	No	Somewhat	Somewhat	Yes	
2.	Spacing for new construction should be consistent with the distances between existing structures on the block to respect the rhythm of the street.	Applicable	No	No	No	No	
<i>F. Massing & Complexity of Form</i>							
1.	In general, use massing that relates to that of existing historic building types on the street. If there are no buildings for reference on the street, relate the new structure to examples of the historic building type in the neighborhood.	Applicable	No	Somewhat	Somewhat	Yes	
2.	If the proposed size of the new building is not consistent with surrounding historic structures, the following techniques may mitigate any adverse impact the structure may have. In some cases, it may be necessary to combine treatments to improve a large building's compatibility with smaller scale of surrounding historic buildings.						
a.	Additive massing - The technique of additive massing is based on the historic practice of enlarging buildings by constructing additions. Where necessary and appropriate, divide a single large volume into smaller components by using additive massing, which consists of breaking up a large building into components that consist of smaller volumes added together.	Applicable	No	Somewhat	Somewhat	Yes	
b.	Vary surface planes of elevations - Varying surface planes of large buildings may be a way to make the structure more consistent with the design of smaller-scaled historic structures in the surrounding area. In order to successfully mitigate the impact of a larger building, the difference between the surface planes may be as little as one foot or as great as ten feet.	Applicable	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
c.	Break up roofline - Breaking up the roofline of a large building into smaller components, such as intersecting gables, may help reduce the perceived mass. Where necessary, reconfigure the roofline of larger structures so that it is more consistent with the form and pitch of the roofs of smaller-scaled historic structures.	Applicable	For new building, only from certain views				
d.	Bay divisions on the elevations - Where necessary and appropriate, create bay divisions on the facade of large buildings to allow the building to reflect the massing of smaller-scaled historic structures.	Applicable	No	Somewhat	Somewhat	Yes	
e.	Vary materials - Use variations in materials, textures, patterns, colors, and details to reduce the visual impact of the mass of large buildings.	Applicable	Somewhat	Yes	Yes	Yes	

DESIGN REVIEW MATRIX							
Project name: <u>New District Courthouse (Review of post-demolition plans)</u>							
Old & Historic District Design Guidelines				Guideline Achieved			
Chapter VII. Guidelines for New Construction							
#	<u>Guideline Summary</u>	<u>Project Applicability</u>	<u>No houses saved</u>	<u>1 ½ houses saved*</u>	<u>2 houses saved</u>	<u>4 houses saved</u>	<u>Comments</u>
f.	Step back upper story - In instances where it is determined to have no adverse impact on the character of the streetscape, stepping back upper stories as a building increases in height may be way to reduce the perceived mass of structure.	Applicable	Only from certain views	Only from certain views	Only from certain views	Yes	
<i>G. Height, Width, Scale & Directional Expression</i>							
1.	Design new building so that height is compatible with adjacent existing structures, with preference given to historic buildings on the street.	Applicable	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
2.	If a proposed building is larger than the surrounding contributing buildings, mitigate the impact of the larger building through architectural design to make it compatible with the smaller scale of Leesburg's historic structures.	Applicable	Somewhat	Somewhat	Yes	Yes	
3.	In areas where there is a mix of historic buildings and recent construction, the scale of the new building should relate to the scale of the historic buildings.	Applicable	No	Somewhat	Yes	Yes	
4.	Reinforce human scale by including appropriate decorative and functional elements that reinforce character of the district/neighborhood such as storefronts on commercial building forms and porches on residential building forms.	Applicable	Monumental scale for new bldg	Monumental scale of new bldg somewhat mitigated	Monumental scale of new bldg somewhat mitigated	Monumental scale of new bldg mitigated by houses	
5.	Where appropriate and consistent with the design of the surrounding historic structures, employ the traditional organization of the three-part commercial facade which is composed of a storefront, upper facade and cornice.	Applicable	Cornice understated on new bldg	Cornice understated on new bldg	Cornice understated on new bldg	Cornice understated on new bldg	
<i>H. Foundations</i>							
1.	Depending building style and the context of neighborhood, it may be appropriate to distinguish foundation from rest of building by use of different materials, patterns or textures, or to make it consistent with the rest of the wall plane.	Applicable	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
2.	Respect the height, contrast of materials, and textures of foundations on surrounding historic buildings	Applicable	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
<i>I. Roof Form</i>							
1.	Design the roof form of a new building to be consistent with the existing structures in that neighborhood of the OHD.	Applicable	No	No	No	No	
2.	Relate the roof forms of new buildings to those of neighboring historic buildings in terms of type, level of complexity, and materials.	Applicable	???	???	???	???	
a.	Traditional Residential Forms - Leesburg's traditionally residential forms typically have gable or hipped roofs. Hipped and gabled dormers are fairly common depending on a building's style, as are cross gables.	Not applicable for new bldg					
b.	Traditional Commercial Forms - The traditional commercial building forms in Leesburg have a wide variety of roof forms, from gable forms (typically parallel to the street) especially on older examples, to a limited number of Mansard examples, to shed roofs, typically hidden behind parapet walls.	Applicable?	Parapet wall on new bldg?	Parapet wall on new bldg?	Parapet wall on new bldg?	Parapet wall on new bldg?	

DESIGN REVIEW MATRIX							
Project name: <u>New District Courthouse (Review of post-demolition plans)</u>							
Old & Historic District Design Guidelines				Guideline Achieved			
Chapter VII. Guidelines for New Construction							
#	<u>Guideline Summary</u>	<u>Project Applicability</u>	<u>No houses saved</u>	<u>1 ½ houses saved*</u>	<u>2 houses saved</u>	<u>4 houses saved</u>	<u>Comments</u>
3.	Roof pitch of new houses should reflect steeper pitch of an older dwelling rather than the shallow pitch of newer tract houses. For residential masses larger than historic precedents, do not try to contain the entire structure under a single roof.	Not applicable					
4.	Roofs on traditional commercial buildings in Leesburg generally are shed or gable. New commercial and mixed-use buildings can incorporate any of these forms but should relate to the majority of roofs of buildings within the block.	Not applicable					
5.	Integrate rooftop-mounted equipment into the overall design of a new building, and screen on all sides consistent with the design of the rest of the building.	Applicable?	???	???	???	???	
J. Doors & Windows							
1.	Traditionally designed openings are generally recessed on masonry buildings and have a raised surround on frame buildings. New construction should follow these methods as opposed to designing openings that are flush with the rest of the wall.	Applicable	???	???	???	???	
2.	Look to the original fabric of existing historic buildings for examples of appropriate door types.	Applicable	No	No	No	No	
3.	Relate doors to styles found on traditional buildings in the neighborhood. Consider incorporating features such as transoms, sidelights and decorative elements when designing entrances for new buildings and if appropriate to the building style.	Applicable	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
4.	Paneled or glazed and paneled doors may be appropriate for new residential buildings, depending on the style of the building and its context.	Not applicable					
5.	Window types and glazing patterns should reflect patterns found in neighborhood.	Applicable	No	No	No	No	
6.	Relate the ratio of solids (walls) to voids (windows and doors) of new buildings to be compatible with that of adjacent traditional facades. Generally, historic buildings have a higher ratio of wall to window except at ground-level storefronts.	Applicable	Not on west and south elevations				
7.	Design the rhythm and placement of window openings to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings of the same type.	Applicable	Not on west and south elevations				
8.	Use a size and proportion of window and door openings, or the ratio of width to height, that is similar to or compatible with those on nearby historic facades.	Applicable	Not on west and south elevations				
9.	Use windows with true divided lights or interior and exterior fixed muntins with internal spacers to reference traditional designs. The profile and dimensions of the muntins should be proportional to the size and design of the windows.	Applicable	COA	COA	COA	COA	
10.	If exterior storm windows and doors are used, install them so that they do not obscure the windows or doors. Storm window divisions, if any, should match those of the window.	Not applicable					
11.	Shutters must be sized to fit the window opening and mounted using appropriate hardware, so as to appear operable. If shutters are used on paired windows, they must be double-hinged.	Not applicable					

DESIGN REVIEW MATRIX							
Project name: <u>New District Courthouse (Review of post-demolition plans)</u>							
Old & Historic District Design Guidelines				<u>Guideline Achieved</u>			
Chapter VII. Guidelines for New Construction							
#	<u>Guideline Summary</u>	<u>Project Applicability</u>	<u>No houses saved</u>	<u>1 ½ houses saved*</u>	<u>2 houses saved</u>	<u>4 houses saved</u>	<u>Comments</u>
<i>K. Porches & Porticos</i>							
1.	Include a porch or portico if stylistically suited to the building's design and if in an area of traditional buildings with these features.	Applicable	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
2.	Design new porches and porticos to be appropriate as to the size, height, proportion and placement of similar existing features in the area, with preference given to the historic buildings found along the street.	Applicable	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
3.	Embellishment for secondary entrances may include decorative trim, transoms, sidelights and lighting that reflect traditional examples.	Applicable	COA	COA	COA	COA	
<i>L. Cornices & Trim</i>							
1.	Consider incorporating cornices and trim in the design of new buildings, particularly if they are adjacent to traditional buildings with such details.	Applicable	No	No	No	No	
2.	Cornice and trim design should be proportional to, and stylistically appropriate for the overall design of the building.	Applicable	COA	COA	COA	COA	
<i>M. Architectural Details & Decoration</i>							
		Applicable	COA	COA	COA	COA	
<i>N. Storefronts</i>							
		Applicable?	???	???	???	???	
<i>O. Awnings, Canopies & Marquees</i>							
		Not applicable					
<i>P. Materials, Texture & Color</i>							
		Applicable	COA	COA	COA	COA	
			28	39	42	52	