



**LEESBURG BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
STAFF REPORT**

**PUBLIC HEARING AND REGULAR MEETING: 6 AUGUST 2012  
AGENDA ITEM 5A**

---

**BAR Case No. THLP-2012-0057: Change cedar shake roof to Fiberglass shingles**

**Reviewer:** Kim K. Del Rance, LEED AP  
**Address:** 521 to 545 E Market St  
**Zoning:** B-2, H-2 Overlay District  
**Applicant/Owner:** Andrew Neumann, Neumann—Bellewood LLC

**Site Description:**

This shopping center was built in 1988 in the H-2 commercial corridor of E Market Street. It is a series of 5 buildings all with the common language in architecture, materials and cedar shake roofing which has aged to a grey. Three of the buildings sit along the back of the lot facing Market Street and two others sit closer to Market Street in the parking lot of the center.

**Context:** Market Street in the H-2 Corridor is primarily commercial architecture showing the outward development from the original historic downtown. This center is on the south side of Market Street which is four lanes wide in this section after joining with Loudoun Street.

**Description of Proposal:**

Owner requests to replace cedar shake shingles with architectural shingles, several color choices have been given for the board to decide between.

This case was discussed on July 16, 2012, but a site visit that will take place on August 6, 2012 before the meeting was deemed necessary to discuss the suitability and appropriateness of the architectural shingles.

**Site Development/Zoning Issues:** None.

**APPLICABLE GUIDELINES**

**P2. of the H-2 Guidelines states:**

**“Additions or alterations to existing structures should be compatible with and enhance the existing design plan whenever possible.”**

- Asphalt shingles replacing cedar shakes is not considered an enhancement to the design plan.

Unless the site visit shows the architectural asphalt shingles convey the traditional architectural features of historic Leesburg, they are not appropriate.

**H-2 Corridor Design Guidelines:**

**P. 22 “Traditional roofing materials that are also appropriate for new construction include slate, wood shakes and standing seam metal such as copper, tin or aluminum.”**

**“Asphalt shingles are generally only appropriate for residential buildings.”**

- Replacing the existing appropriate cedar shake roof with architectural asphalt shingles that are visible and make up a significant part of the view from Market Street as well as from the center's own parking lot is not appropriate as stated above in the H-2 Corridor guidelines.

Metal roofing was also discussed at the July 16, 2012 meeting and the applicant stated it was less costly than a new cedar shake roof, but more costly than a new architectural shingle roof. However, when durability is considered and the long term cost of roofing materials, metal roofs consistently out last asphalt roofs and requires less maintenance and fewer repairs.

Metal roofing, traditional standing seam roofing, is a traditional material that is closely tied to the heritage of historic Leesburg and is appropriate.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION/DRAFT MOTION**

(Based on the BAR's discussion at the meeting, any changes to the language of either part of the motion should be incorporated as necessary.)

**Based on the findings that:**

- Wood shakes are a traditional material that is also appropriate for new construction
- Asphalt shingles are generally only appropriate for residential buildings
- Alterations to existing buildings should be compatible with and enhance design plans

Staff recommends denial of TLHP-2012-0057 subject to the materials submitted as part of this application material set June 06, 2012.

- **However, staff could recommend approval of a replacement roof of standing seam metal with a traditional rolled edge.**

**DRAFT MOTION**

I move that TLHP-2012-0057 be denied subject to the application submitted by Andrew Neumann on June 06, 2012 and subject to the findings as stated in the August 6, 2012 Staff Report (or as amended by the BAR on August 6, 2012).