

STAFF REPORT

To: Board of Architectural Review
From: Kevin Lawlor, Sr. Planner
Date: BAR Meeting Feb. 22, 2012
Re: Agenda Item 6.b.

BAR CASE TLHP-2012-0005

Address: 19 North King Street

Project: Install new stairway on rear of building along with new door. Reduce height of existing chimney to approximately 2 ft. above roof peak. Add four storm windows over existing attic level windows. Remove rear addition and side door canopy from previous approval (TLHP-2011-0020).

Zoned: B-1 w/ H-1 Overlay

Applicant: Dieter Meyer, W.A. Brown & Associates, for property owner

Architect/Contractor: W.A. Brown & Associates, architects

ISSUE

The applicant is requesting to amend the previous B.A.R. approval case TLHP-2011-0020 (6/20/11). The previously approved addition on the rear of the building is proposed to be eliminated and replaced with a metal stairway and new door on the 2nd floor where the existing window is located on the rear of the building. In addition the applicant is requesting to install storm windows over the existing attic windows, remove the previously approved entry canopy over the side door on the north side of the structure and reduce the existing center chimney to a height approximately 2 feet above the roof line.

In reviewing this project, staff referred to, and the BAR should use, the Old and Historic District Design Guidelines.

STAFF ASSESSMENT

As to the elimination of the proposed entry canopy and rear addition, staff has no issues since this would leave the structure in its current condition. The new stairwell proposed on the rear (west) elevation are proposed to be metal which is not typical for a Federal style structure or the time period. However, with that stated, the rear (west) elevation has little if any visibility to the public right-of-way. Stairs can be construed as a modern rehabilitation such as an elevator. The BAR may determine that the lack of visibility of an elevation from a public right-of-way mitigates any impact that the project may have on the character of the building, site or historic district overall.

The door proposed to go along with this stairwell is going to match the existing door on the side (north) elevation. Secondary entrances tend to be more utilitarian. Buildings of a traditionally commercial design may have delivery doors that are utilitarian but also help define the character of the building. Staff is of the opinion the door as proposed meets this criteria.

The structure currently has four chimneys. The applicant would like to reduce the height of the chimney located in the middle to be approximately 2 feet above the existing roof line. Staff is concerned this may create a more modern symmetry between the chimneys which may not be period appropriate. Federal style structures typically have tall chimneys. Would repair be more appropriate versus reduction? Again, since visibility to the right-of-way is minimal or none at all, the impact could be negated like with the stairs.

The four storm windows proposed to be located on the four attic windows are wood and appear to be of the type previously approved by the Board.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION/DRAFT MOTION

Based on the facts that:

- The early-nineteenth-century building is a contributing resource in the Old and Historic District; and
- The addition of the metal stairs is not in keeping with the Federal style but may be mitigated by the absence of view from the public right-of-way; and
- The lowering of the chimney may not be in keeping with the Federal style and period, but may also be mitigated by the absence of view from the public right-of-way; and
- The addition of the 4 wood storm windows on the four attic windows is in keeping with similar approvals; and
- The removal of the previously approved rear (west) elevation addition and side (north) elevation canopy over the existing door have no effect since these additions have not been built.

I move to approve TLHP-2012-0005 as amended with the following clarifications (should the BAR have any):

Or;

I move to approve the portion of TLHP-2012-0005 relating to the storm windows and removal of the previously approved rear (west) elevation addition and side (north) elevation entrance canopy approved with TLHP-2011-0020.

The Board finds that the stairway addition being made of metal is inconsistent with the Federal style and era along with the lowering of the chimney not being in conformance with a Federal period structure.