



LEESBURG BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT

PUBLIC HEARING: MARCH 19, 2012
AGENDA ITEM 6b

BAR CASE No.: THLP-2011-0013
Reviewer: Christopher Murphy, Zoning Administrator
Address: 104 Loudoun Street, LLC.
Zoning: B-1, H-1 Overlay District
Applicant/Owner: PR Construction
Architect: T.J. Gilbride Architects, Inc
Builder: PR Construction

Site Description: A mostly vacant 3,507 square foot (0.0805 acre) narrow rectangular lot approx. 49 feet wide at its widest point and approx. 77 feet at its deepest point. The existing garage for the building at 106 Loudoun Street encroaches approximately 15 feet onto the subject property for about 32.5 feet along the western boundary.

Context: The lot fronts on a mixed-use two lane through street with no on-street parking. Chapter VII Section A of the H-1 Design Guidelines Choosing the Appropriate Building Form for the Site provides, “[W]hen designing new buildings in the historic district, the overall distinctive district character should be considered, as well as the great variety of historic building types, styles and scales.” The subject property is situated within the area identified as the West Market Street Neighborhoods in Chapter III of the H-1 Design Guidelines. The West Market Street Neighborhoods are described as being a collection of predominately residential neighborhoods whose designs range from 1780’s Federal style through 1950’s Colonial Revival. The subject property sits on the architecturally significant 100 block of Loudoun Street that is characterized by the presence of mainly Federal style buildings, scattered with Eighteenth-Century Vernacular, Georgian, and Italianate styles. Most buildings are pulled up to the sidewalk with little variation in building setbacks. Many buildings have existing encroachments into the public right of way, mainly in the form of steps and landings. Building heights range from 1½ to 2½ stories. The majority of the buildings on this block are constructed with either brick or stone exteriors. Two structures are clad in wooden siding and one, the structure adjacent at 102 Loudoun, is brick covered in stucco. One feature that is consistent throughout the block is the presence of visible foundations.

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to construct a new 2 ½ story, 5-unit residential/commercial – mixed use building on a vacant lot on the north side of Loudoun Street S.W. This will necessitate the removal of the garage portion of the building at 106 Loudoun Street that encroaches onto the subject property. Less than 40% of the exterior wall/roof of the 106 Loudoun building will be removed and is therefore considered to be an alteration and not a demolition in accordance with TLZO Sec. 7.5.8.B.

The proposed building is generally rectangular in shape and set on a zero front yard setback along the front (south) property line respecting the established front yard setbacks on this block of Loudoun Street. A setback of 5.75 feet is proposed on the east side adjacent to 102 Loudoun Street. On the west side a

setback of 12 is proposed along the front 27.5 feet to accommodate a driveway off of Loudoun Street. The building then jogs west 8.5 feet and will be setback from the western boundary line 3.5 feet to the rear of the building which will sit 15 feet from the rear (north) property line with 19 Wirt Street.

In appearance the building will resemble a building fronting on the street with an addition to the rear. The front will be in the vernacular Georgian style, three bay, side-gabled roof with 12/12 pitch, and 6-over-6 double hung windows with shutters on the front façade only. The façade material for the front part of the building will be stucco finish over metal lath of an undetermined color. The roof on the front part will be covered with pre-finished 20 inch wide x 1 inch high black standing seam metal roof.

The rear section of the building will be clad in 6 inch Hardie Plank lap siding primed and painted. The rear section will also have the 6-over-6 double hung windows with no shutters. The rear will have French doors leading out from each level. The first floor opens to a patio, the second and third open onto wrought iron balconies extending 3 feet out from the building. The roof on the rear portion will be covered with Architectural Composition shingles of an undetermined color.

Gutters will be 6 inch wide "K" style gutters of an undetermined color. Downspouts will be 4 inch diameter metal downspouts, style and color to match the building trim.

| SETBACKS & HEIGHT TABLE | | |
|-------------------------|---|---|
| | B-1 District | Proposed |
| Front Yard | 1-20' but may be 0' per 10.4.5.D | 0' |
| Side Yard | | |
| East | 0' | 5.75' |
| West | 0' | Varies from 12' to 3.5' |
| Rear Yard | 15' minimum | 15' |
| Height | 35' (residential) maximum measured to midpoint of the roof | 29.5' to midpoint of roof; 37' at highest point. |

STAFF ASSESSMENT

Setbacks. The proposed building will have a zero front yard setback along the lot's Loudoun Street frontage. This setback is consistent with the existing buildings along this block and by this will maintain the traditional plane of buildings along the street. TLZO Sec. 10.4.5.D Reduction of Front Yard Requirements in the Historic District allows the BAR and the Zoning Administrator to permit a building "to be located closer to the street frontage than otherwise authorized by the underlying district, up to the average setback of existing buildings . . . which abut the property along the street frontage" so long as the applicant has demonstrated "that the proposed structure will be compatible with the surrounding properties and will not interfere with the light, air, convenience of access, public improvements, safety from fire, flood and other dangers."

Along the western side yard, the building will be setback 12 feet for the first 27.5 feet in order to maintain a driveway off of Loudoun Street. The entrance to the building will be provided at the end of this driveway where the building jogs towards the western property boundary 8.5 feet, thus creating a setback of +/- 3.5 feet to the end of the building that sits 15 feet from the rear (northern) property line. A setback of +/- 5.75 feet will be maintained along the eastern side yard adjacent to 102 Loudoun Street.

The proposed setbacks are in keeping with the character of the setbacks between existing historic buildings along this block. There is only one other curb cut along this block of Loudoun Street, and that driveway

provides access to a parking area in the rear of the buildings on the opposite side of Loudoun Street from the subject property. The proposed driveway will not lead to a rear parking area, but instead allow a vehicle to sit in the front of the building. Such a feature is more characteristic of automobile-oriented, suburban design that is inappropriate on this block of Loudoun Street. Maintaining this driveway and locating the entrance at its end 27.5 feet from the street creates an inconsistency with the Orientation guidelines provided in Section D.

Orientation. Section D of Chapter VII Orientation tells us, “[O]rientation refers to the direction in which the primary façade and most important entry to the building faces.” Every building along this block of Loudoun Street has its primary entrance on Loudoun Street. As designed, the proposed building will set its primary (only) entrance 27.5 feet back from the street. As stated above, the primary façade will resemble a three bay, vernacular Georgian style. However, unlike the typical Georgian design, this building will not have an entrance in the primary façade. The result of not providing such a characteristic element of the architectural style being emulated will have an adverse affect on the character of the block. Because of the similar façade material and narrow spacing between the proposed building and 102 Loudoun Street, this building and 102 Loudoun could appear to be a single building. Not providing an entrance on the primary façade of the building could also have an adverse affect on the building when looking at Massing and Complexity of Form in Section F. The lack of an entry directly onto the street would make this building unique on the 100 Block of Loudoun Street block in a manner not encouraged by the guidelines and would make it appear less engaged to the street than other buildings in the vicinity.

Massing and Complexity of Form. The proposed building is designed to be covered in stucco on the front portion underneath the front gable. The remainder of the building will appear to be an addition to an existing building and set apart by a perpendicular extension of the roof to another side-gabled roof in the rear, and that portion of the building clad in siding. Different sidings, different roof orientation and the 8.5 foot jog in the wall gives the appearance of a series of masses versus one single mass. However, without an entrance on the Loudoun Street façade, the appearance of additive massing is not achieved.

The proposed building will have a consistent height of +/- 37 feet to the top of the ridge and will be setback from the existing buildings 5.75 feet or 3.5 feet respectively. The size of this building placed this close to adjoining, smaller buildings (1½ and 2 story respectively) could appear too large in comparison. Elevation drawings illustrating the relationship between the proposed building and its adjoining neighbors should be provided for the BAR to review.

Foundations. Along this block of Loudoun Street, each of the existing buildings has a raised foundation. The front portion of the proposed building is not proposed to have a raised foundation with a different material. Failing to provide this element could adversely impact the overall rhythm and balance of the streetscape by making the proposed building look out of scale with the existing buildings on the block.

Doors and Windows. The Exterior Materials list provided with the application indicates the windows are proposed to have simulated divided light muntins. The Guidelines for Doors and Windows in new construction recommend using windows with true divided lights or interior and exterior fixed muntins with internal spacers (i.e., simulated divided light) to reference traditional designs. (Chapter VII. Sec. J.) The three-part simulated divided light windows proposed are appropriate for use. Having windows with a more traditional, authentic look will be important especially in the façade and front part of the proposed building due to the building’s presence along the sidewalk on this block of Loudoun Street.

The proposed design takes care to provide shutters on hinges with shutter dogs on all of the windows facing Loudoun Street. However, these are the only windows where shutters will be installed. The windows proposed on the western façade of the front portion of the building will be highly visible from Loudoun Street as a result of the wider separation to accommodate the driveway. Not providing shutters on these windows will work against the effort in the design to make the front resemble an original building that was added on to. (See the eastern side of the Birkby House for side windows with shutters.)

Balcony. The rear balconies are characterized by iron railings that appear more characteristic of those found in the deep south such as New Orleans. A local traditional balcony design would be more appropriate.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION/DRAFT MOTION

(Based on the BAR's discussion at the meeting, any changes to the language of either part of the motion should be incorporated as necessary.)

Based on the fact that:

The application shows a building with design elements that, as proposed, are inconsistent with the Design Guidelines for Orientation and Setback, Massing and Complexity of Form, Foundations and Doors and Windows.

Staff recommends deferral of TLHP-2012-0013 to allow the BAR time to work with the applicant to amend the proposal, bringing it into compliance with the H-1 Design Guidelines. Specifically, staff recommends further discussion of the following details:

- Location of the single parking space in front of building
- Location of the primary entrance/lack of a door in front façade
- Lack of a raised foundation
- Installing shutters on windows on the side elevations
- Examination of the massing of the building – provide an elevation drawing showing the proposed building compared with its adjoining buildings on 102 and 106 Loudoun Street
- Other issues identified by the BAR